

## CITY OF NANAIMO

### BUSINESS CASE – Downtown Nanaimo Community Safety Action Plan Strategy

#### CURRENT OVERVIEW

The City of Nanaimo (the City) has been experiencing an increase in homelessness, open drug use, and social disorder in the downtown core. In 2022, the Downtown Nanaimo Community Safety Action Plan (DNCSAP) was implemented to provide a response to the issues affecting the safety and viability of the City's downtown area.

In 2023, funding was allocated from the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General through the Community Safety and Wellbeing Plan which the City used to evaluate the DNCSAP and consider options for expanding and enhancing initiatives.

In 2024, the City retained the consultant, Deloitte, to evaluate the DNCSAP. The findings in the Downtown Nanaimo Community Safety Action Evaluation and Strategy Alignment Report (DNCSAP Evaluation Report) were presented to the Governance and Priorities Committee on 2024-APR-29. Preferred scenarios in this report included the addition of Community Safety Officers (CSOs) and Community Clean Team members whose presence downtown have made a notable impact on the perception of safety and cleanliness. Staff were directed to proceed with a cost analysis of the preferred scenarios and to prepare a business case for 2025 budget deliberations.

The Community Safety Officer Program currently has 12 FTEs, 11 Community Safety Officers (CSOs) and one Senior Community Safety Officer (CSO), who oversees the team. The Community Clean Team Program has 4 FTEs (2 Clean Teams) and report to the Supervisor, Sanitation and Cemetery.

#### Community Safety Officers Program

The three scenarios presented by Deloitte in the DNCSAP Evaluation Report for the Community Safety Officer Program included the following (see Appendix A for costing):

- **Scenario 1:** Increase the program to 22 FTEs by adding nine new CSOs and one new Senior CSO. Increasing staffing will ensure adequate coverage of existing schedules and the safety and wellbeing of officers. The additional FTEs will help maintain the recommended standard staffing level of two, 2-person teams providing coverage from 07:00-23:00 (16 hours/day excluding stats).
- **Scenario 2:** Increase the program to 26 FTEs by adding 13 new CSOs and one new Senior CSO to provide 24x7 coverage, 7 days a week. To achieve this, scenario 2 recommends changing the shift pattern to 3x8 hour shifts to cover the 24x7 period.
- **Scenario 3:** Increase the program to 32 FTEs by adding 19 new CSOs and one new Senior CSO to expand the geographical coverage outside of the downtown core.
  - Staff determined that a more detailed investigation would be required to cost out this scenario due to the added complexity of needing to lease additional space to accommodate the recommended staffing level of 32 FTEs and increased geographical coverage.

After reviewing the scenarios for adding additional Community Safety Officers, staff have provided their recommended implementation plan which is a modified version of scenario 1. The plan would involve

hiring nine new CSOs and one new Senior CSO utilizing a phased approach, hiring staff over two years; five CSOs and one Senior CSO in 2025 and four CSOs in 2026. This phased approach would reduce the budget impact on 2025 and allow staff time to plan and expand the department on a more gradual basis which would assist with the overall onboarding of additional staff.

In addition, staff also took into consideration the administrative impact of adding additional CSOs on the Bylaw department. Currently the City's CSOs respond to over 1,000 calls for service each month. As a result, the CSOs spend a sizeable amount of time on administrative tasks such as file creation and documentation. To alleviate some of this administrative burden, the conversion of the current permanent part-time Bylaw Steno position to a permanent full-time position has been added to the recommended option.

After staff reviewed scenarios 2 and 3, it was determined a more gradual expansion to the department would be the recommended approach. Scenario 2 in the DNCSAP Evaluation Report recommended 24x7 coverage which included changing the current 10-hour shift pattern to 3x8 hour shifts. Staff determined transitioning to 3x8 hour shifts would not allow for staff to have enough time to recover mentally in between shifts and would also require agreement from the Union to alter the current shift pattern. Recruitment would also pose a challenge in finding staff willing to work the graveyard shifts. As a result of these challenges, scenario 2 covering 24x7 coverage is not being recommended.

Lastly, scenario 3 is not being considered as an option at this time. Staff determined that a more detailed analysis would be required due to the need to investigate the leasing of new space to accommodate the increased staffing level.

### **Community Clean Team Program**

The two scenarios presented by Deloitte for the Community Clean Team (Clean Team) included the following (see Appendix A for costing):

- **Scenario 1:** Increase to six FTEs by adding two new Clean Team members to ensure sustained coverage of downtown.
- **Scenario 2:** Increase to ten FTEs by adding six new Clean Team members to expand coverage outside of the downtown core.

After reviewing the scenarios for adding additional Clean Teams, staff have provided their recommended implementation plan which recommends delaying a decision on additional Clean Teams to a future budget cycle and in the interim adding additional resources to support encampment and public spaces cleaning.

The interim option recommends the addition of a Superintendent who would report to the Manager of Sanitation, Recycling and Cemeteries. This position would provide additional capacity to oversee public space cleanliness as the department's workload has increased in recent years, including the addition of two Clean Teams. The option also includes additional funding for contracted services to deal with large encampments and other social disorder cleanup. This additional funding will provide staff with the ability to engage additional resources for encampment cleanups and other cleaning assistance on an as needed, on call basis. Staff would then bring forward a business case for additional Clean Team(s) in a future budget cycle based on when it is determined staff capacity within the current teams is insufficient.

Staff have also provided an alternative option which would be to implement Scenario 1 by adding two new Clean Team members but with an anticipated start date of April 2026. This option also recommends the addition of a Superintendent who would report to the Manager of Sanitation, Recycling and Cemeteries. The April 2026 start date has been selected as staff have determined there is enough capacity within the existing Clean Team staff pool for 2025. Staff anticipate additional resources will be required in the future due to the increase in homelessness and social disorder.

### **BUSINESS ISSUE**

The City of Nanaimo continues to experience homelessness, open drug-use, conflict, vandalism, lack of cleanliness and overall social disorder in the Downtown core and surrounding neighbourhoods. The DNCSA Evaluation Report found that the presence of Community Safety Officers and Clean Teams have made a notable impact on the perception of safety and cleanliness of the Downtown Area, but also determined additional resources are required to continue to address the overall safety and cleanliness of the Downtown Area.

### **EXPECTED OUTCOME**

Increasing the number of Community Safety Officers and resources for public space cleanliness servicing downtown is expected to have the following desired outcomes:

- Improved perception of downtown and surrounding neighbourhoods
- Tangible decrease in social disorder
- Support for businesses and neighbourhoods
- Support for service providers and non-profits
- Connection to services
- Compassion based approach
- Corporate and community expectations and responsibilities understood

### **OPTIONS – COMMUNITY SAFETY OFFICERS PROGRAM**

#### **Option #1 – Add 10 new FTEs to the Community Safety Officer Program and convert the permanent part-time Bylaw Steno position to permanent full-time position.**

Create nine permanent full-time Community Safety Officer positions reporting to a new permanent full-time Senior Community Safety Officer utilizing a phased approach by hiring five CSOs, 1 Senior CSO and converting the permanent part-time Bylaw Steno position to a permanent full-time position effective April 1, 2025. Add the remaining four CSOs effective April 1, 2026. The addition of two fleet units is required to support these new positions and the purchases would be phased over 2025 and 2026.

Benefits:

- Phased approach will reduce the impact on the 2025 budget and allow staff more time to plan and expand the department on a gradual basis assisting with the onboarding of additional staff.
- Properly resource the department to increase the level of service in downtown Nanaimo as the City experiences increases with homelessness, open drug use, conflict, vandalism, and overall social disorder.
- Increased perception of safety and cleanliness for the citizens and visitors of Nanaimo.
- Decreased social disorder through a compassion-based approach.
- Increased connection to services for vulnerable populations.

- Converting the permanent part-time Bylaw Steno position to full-time will free up Community Safety Officers’ capacity to spend more time on patrol by alleviating time spent on administrative tasks such as file creation and documentation.

**Weaknesses:**

- Permanent increase to operating budget and one-time costs.
- Phased approach would take longer to get to the recommended standard staffing levels.

**Financial Analysis (see Appendix B for additional details):**

- The total wages and benefits for the addition of five CSOs, one Senior CSO and converting the permanent part-time Bylaw Steno position based on April 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025 start is estimated at \$549,100. The 2026 budget impact is estimated at \$1,124,700 which includes wages and benefits for the staffing changes in 2025 and the additional four CSOs effective April 1, 2026.
- Additional operating costs are estimated at \$39,400 in 2025 for a temporary rental vehicle, fleet charges, professional development, computer charges, cell phones and materials and supplies. Additional operating costs for 2026 are estimated at \$82,700.
- Operating savings of \$158,300 in 2025 and \$161,600 in 2026 are anticipated from a reduction in over-time and elimination of management consulting budget.
- One-time costs upon the creation of the positions in 2025 are estimated at \$178,100. This includes the purchase of one electric fleet unit, dual head EV charger, uniforms, lockers, tools, computer equipment and cell phones. 2026 one-time costs are estimated to be \$116,200 which includes the purchase of one electric fleet unit, uniforms, computer equipment and cell phones.

**Funding Option #1 - Funded by Property Taxes**

**Estimated Impact – Based on Draft Financial Plan**

	<b>2025</b>	<b>2026</b>	<b>2027</b>
Budget Increase	\$608,300	\$1,162,000	\$1,190,200
Projected Property Tax Increase	0.41%	0.34%	0.02%

**Funding Option #2 - Fleet Units and EV Charging Station Funded by Reserves**

**Estimated Impact – Based on Draft Financial Plan**

	<b>2025</b>	<b>2026</b>	<b>2027</b>
Budget Increase	\$608,300	\$1,162,000	\$1,190,200
Projected Property Tax Increase	0.33%	0.36%	0.06%

**Option# 2 – Status Quo**

Continue with the current organizational structure.

**Benefits:**

- No impact to operating budget.

**Weaknesses:**

- Visible decrease to safety and cleanliness as capacity of existing CSOs cannot keep up with increasing homelessness and social disorder.

## OPTIONS – COMMUNITY CLEAN TEAM

### Option# 1 – Increase funding for contracted services and add a Superintendent, Sanitation, Recycling & Cemeteries in 2025.

Increase funding available for contracted services to assist with encampment cleanups and other social disorder cleaning services on an as needed, on call basis in 2025 by \$50,000 and 2026 by \$100,000. Add one permanent full-time Superintendent, Sanitation, Recycling and Cemeteries reporting to the Manager of Sanitation, Recycling and Cemeteries effective April 1, 2025.

#### Benefits:

- Additional resources to call upon when needed.
- Flexibility to adjust the budget based on current environment.
- Provides additional supervisory capacity in the Sanitation and Cemeteries section.

#### Weaknesses:

- Availability of contractors willing to perform this service.
- Increase to operating budget.

#### Financial Analysis (see Appendix B for additional details):

- Position is anticipated to be an excluded position level 5, with an annual salary of \$120,080 plus benefits. 2025 budget impact including benefits is estimated at \$109,100 based on an April 1<sup>st</sup> start, 2026 budget impact is estimated at \$153,600.
- Additional annual costs are anticipated at \$4,600 for membership dues, professional development, phone charges and computer charges for the management position.
- Additional contracted services are anticipated at \$50,000 in 2025 and \$100,000 in 2026. No additional funding in 2027 is requested at this time as staff would return to Council prior to 2027 with an update on resourcing requirements to maintain level of service.
- One-time costs upon the creation of the position are projected at \$10,200. This includes the purchase of computer, desk, chair and smart phone.

#### Estimated Impact – Based on Draft Financial Plan

	2025	2026	2027
Budget Increase	\$173,900	\$258,500	\$164,800
Projected Property Tax Increase	0.12%	0.05%	-0.05%

### Option #2 – Addition of a third Community Clean Team and Superintendent, Sanitation, Recycling & Cemeteries in 2026.

Addition of two permanent full-time staff to create another Community Clean Team and the addition of one permanent full-time Superintendent, Sanitation, Recycling and Cemeteries reporting to the Manager of Sanitation, Recycling and Cemeteries. The Clean Team would be equipped with a cab-over truck with roll-off bin lift for the collection of garbage, abandoned items, bulky items, shopping carts, and personal items.

#### Benefits:

- Proactive response to waste in streets, roads, and other public spaces.

- Waste removal strains removed from Bylaw and Community Safety Officers allowing them to concentrate on their tasks.
- Long-term planning, higher collection capacity and operational efficiency, and lower cost per tonne for waste collection
- Strategically placed bins increase capacity for waste disposal through larger temporary storage and hauling capacity
- Provide resourcing to the department to support additional Clean Team.
- Reduces the chance of employee burn out and provides supervisory redundancy in the Sanitation and Cemeteries section.

Weaknesses:

- Permanent increase to operating budget and one-time costs.

Financial Analysis (see Appendix B for additional details):

- The total wages and benefits for the addition of two Community Clean Team staff and one Superintendent, Sanitation, Recycling and Cemeteries based on an April 1<sup>st</sup>, 2026 start is estimated at \$279,600. 2027 budget impact is estimated at \$384,700.
- Additional operating costs are estimated at \$61,100 in 2026 for fleet charges, disposal costs, computer charges, cell phones, mileage, materials, and supplies. Additional operating costs for 2027 are estimated at \$79,700.
- One-time costs upon the creation of the positions are projected at \$230,400 in 2026. This includes the purchase of one fleet unit, roll-off bin, cell phones, desk and chair.

Funding Option #1 - Funded by Property Taxes

Funding Option #1 - Funded by Property Taxes

Estimated Impact – Based on Draft Financial Plan

	2025	2026	2027
Budget Increase	\$0	\$571,100	\$464,400
Projected Property Tax Increase	0.00%	0.35%	-0.06%

Funding Option #2 - Fleet Units and Roll-Off Bin Funded by Reserves

Estimated Impact – Based on Draft Financial Plan

	2025	2026	2027
Budget Increase	\$0	\$571,100	\$464,400
Projected Property Tax Increase	0.00%	0.21%	0.07%

**Option# 3 – Status Quo**

Continue with the current organizational structure.

Benefits:

- No impact to operating budget.

Weaknesses:

- Visible decrease to safety and cleanliness as capacity of existing CSOs and Clean Team cannot keep up with increasing homelessness and social disorder.
- Capacity not sufficient to support additional Community Clean Teams.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Community Safety Officers: Option #1 Adding 10 new FTEs to Community Safety Officer Program and converting the permanent part-time Bylaw Steno position to full-time.

Community Clean Team: Option #1 Increase funding for contracted services and add a Superintendent, Sanitation, Recycling & Cemeteries in 2025.

Appendix A

**Community Safety Officers Program**

**DNCSAP Evaluation Report Options - Consultant's Scenarios**

	Projected Budget Impact (\$'s)		Notes
	2025	2026	
<b>Scenario 1</b>			
One-Time Costs			
Fleet Units and EV Charger	197,800	-	
Other Equipment/Uniforms	92,200	-	
<b>Total One-Time Costs</b>	<b>290,000</b>	<b>-</b>	
Annual Operating Expenditures			
Wages and Benefits*	759,800	1,198,100	5 CSOs & 1 Senior CSO April 1, 2025, 4 CSO July 1, 2025
Other Operating Expenditures	57,000	93,900	
Less Savings:			
Overtime	(4,400)	(4,600)	
Mgmt Consulting	(153,900)	(157,000)	
<b>Total Annual Operating Expenditures</b>	<b>658,500</b>	<b>1,130,400</b>	
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>948,500</b>	<b>1,130,400</b>	

**Scenario 2**

One-Time Costs			
Fleet Units and EV Charger	197,800	-	
Other Equipment/Uniforms	123,800	-	
<b>Total One-Time Costs</b>	<b>321,600</b>	<b>-</b>	
Annual Operating Expenditures			
Wages and Benefits*	1,048,800	1,672,800	7 CSOs & 1 Senior CSO April 1, 2025, 6 CSO July 1, 2025
Other Operating Expenditures	66,700	115,100	
Less Savings:			
Overtime	(4,400)	(4,600)	
Mgmt Consulting	(153,900)	(157,000)	
Parkade Security	(85,500)	(174,400)	
<b>Total Annual Operating Expenditures</b>	<b>871,700</b>	<b>1,451,900</b>	
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>1,193,300</b>	<b>1,451,900</b>	

Scenario 3 - costing not available at this time

\*No additional clerical support

**Community Clean Team Program**

**DNCSAP Evaluation Report Options - Consultant's Scenarios**

	Projected Budget Impact (\$'s)		Notes
	2025	2026	
<b>Scenario 1</b>			
One-Time Costs			
Fleet Units	180,000	-	
Roll-Off Bins	19,500	-	
Other Equipment	700	-	
<b>Total One-Time Costs</b>	<b>200,200</b>	<b>-</b>	
Annual Operating Expenditures			
Wages and Benefits*	163,500	223,700	2 Clean Team Members April 1, 2025 with Backfill
Other Operating Expenditures	54,700	71,800	
<b>Total Annual Operating Expenditures</b>	<b>218,200</b>	<b>295,500</b>	
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>418,400</b>	<b>295,500</b>	

**Scenario 2**

One-Time Costs			
Fleet Unit	540,000	-	
Roll-Off Bin	58,500	-	
Other Equipment	2,000	-	
<b>Total One-Time Costs</b>	<b>600,500</b>	<b>-</b>	
Annual Operating Expenditures			
Wages and Benefits*	490,500	671,000	6 Clean Team Members April 1, 2025 with Backfill
Other Operating Expenditures	164,000	215,500	
<b>Total Annual Operating Expenditures</b>	<b>654,500</b>	<b>886,500</b>	
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>1,255,000</b>	<b>886,500</b>	

All costs rounded to the nearest \$100



**Appendix B**

**Community Safety Officers Program**

**Staff Recommendation**

	Projected Budget Impact (\$'s)		Notes
	2025	2026	
<b>Scenario 1</b>			
One-Time Costs			
Fleet Units and EV Charger	119,600	82,100	
Other Equipment/Uniforms	58,500	34,100	
<b>Total One-Time Costs</b>	<b>178,100</b>	<b>116,200</b>	
Annual Operating Expenditures			
Wages and Benefits	549,100	1,124,700	5 CSOs, 1 Senior CSO & 0.5 Bylaw Steno April 1, 2025, 4 CSO April 1, 2026
Other Operating Expenditures	39,400	82,700	
Less Savings:			
Overtime	(4,400)	(4,600)	
Mgmt Consulting	(153,900)	(157,000)	
<b>Total Annual Operating Expenditures</b>	<b>430,200</b>	<b>1,045,800</b>	
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>608,300</b>	<b>1,162,000</b>	

**Community Clean Team Program**

**Staff Recommendation**

	Projected Budget Impact (\$'s)		Notes
	2025	2026	
<b>Scenario 1</b>			
One-Time Costs			
Other Equipment	10,200	-	
<b>Total One-Time Costs</b>	<b>10,200</b>	<b>-</b>	
Annual Operating Expenditures			
Wages and Benefits*	109,100	153,600	Superintendent April 1, 2025
Contracted Services	50,000	100,000	
Other Operating Expenditures	4,600	4,900	
<b>Total Annual Operating Expenditures</b>	<b>163,700</b>	<b>258,500</b>	
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>173,900</b>	<b>258,500</b>	

**Alternative Option**

	Projected Budget Impact (\$'s)		Notes
	2026	2027	
<b>Scenario 1 - Modified</b>			
One-Time Costs			
Fleet Units	198,000	-	
Roll-Off Bins	21,500	-	
Other Equipment	10,900	-	
<b>Total One-Time Costs</b>	<b>230,400</b>	<b>-</b>	
Annual Operating Expenditures			
Wages and Benefits*	279,600	384,700	2 Clean Team Members with Backfill & Superintendent April 1, 2026
Other Operating Expenditures	61,100	79,700	
<b>Total Annual Operating Expenditures</b>	<b>340,700</b>	<b>464,400</b>	
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>571,100</b>	<b>464,400</b>	

All costs rounded to the nearest \$100